Review of accumulative failure of winding insulation subjected to repetitive impulse voltages

Potao Sun1,2,3, Wenxia Sima1, Xiongwei Jiang3, Dingfei Zhang2, Jiahui He1, Lian Ye1

1State Key Laboratory of Power Transmission Equipment & System Security and New Technology, Chongqing University, Chongqing 400030, People’s Republic of China
2Department of Materials Science, College of Engineering Materials, Chongqing University, Chongqing 400030, People’s Republic of China
3Department of Electrical and Computer Engineering, University of Florida, Gainesville, FL 32611, USA

Abstract: The premature failure phenomenon that occurs in solid insulation under the application of repetitive impulse voltages is known as the accumulative effect of impulse voltages on a solid dielectric. The accumulative failure of winding insulation is considered to be a core problem resulting from this phenomenon. The main problems include the accumulative failure of motor winding insulation under pulse-width modulation impulses and the accumulative failure of transformer winding insulation under the application of overvoltages, and these problems represent new challenges in the safe and stable operation of power grids. With regards to the above problems, this study reviews the results of recent research on the accumulative failure characteristics and mechanisms of winding insulation when subjected to repetitive impulse voltages. The challenges faced are discussed at the end of this study.

1 Introduction

The accumulative effect, which first appeared in psychological research, is an important term in this paper. Psychologists define this term as the continuous action of a specific external factor on an object that leads to change in the object's properties and state. In 1956, the concept of the accumulative effect was first proposed for use in electrical engineering research by Standing. He studied the breakdown characteristics of synthetic resin-bonded paper sheets and found that the solid dielectric broke down under application of repetitive impulse voltages, despite the amplitude of the applied impulse voltage is much lower than that of the breakdown voltage of the dielectric [1]. In the following decades, the accumulative effect of repetitive impulse voltages on insulation did not draw much attention until the 1990s, when researchers found that premature failure may occur when the winding insulation of inverter-fed motors was subjected to repetitive impulse voltages caused by pulse-width modulation (PWM)-type inverters. An interesting phenomenon is a typical accumulative insulation failure and raised widespread concern [2–5]. Thereafter, in 1996, it was pointed out that oil-paper insulation used in power transformers broke down prematurely when subjected to repetitive impulse voltages [6]. Later, in the 2010s, and following an appeal by Okabe, an increasing number of researchers began to study the accumulative failure phenomenon in oil-paper insulation subjected to repetitive impulse voltages and many useful results were obtained [7–9]. The present paper reviews important achievements made in recent decades with regards to the accumulative failure of winding insulation subjected to repetitive impulse voltages and discusses future challenges in this research area.

2 Accumulative failure of inverter-fed-motor winding insulation

The square output waves of PWM-type inverters have fast front/tail voltage waves and high frequencies and amplitudes. These repetitive impulse voltages can lead to premature failure of the winding insulation in inverter-fed motors [10–20].

2.1 Impulse voltage waveform on winding insulation in inverter-fed motors

In the PWM drive system of an inverter-fed-motor, the PWM-type inverter outputs square-wave voltages with various pulse widths. The circuit structure of the PWM drive system is illustrated in Fig. 1. Reflection and refraction of the wave may occur when an impulse wave travels through the cable that connects the motor to the PWM drive system. An impedance mismatch can double or triple the front voltage of the impulse [21, 22]. A typical impulse voltage of an inverter-fed-motor is plotted in Fig. 2 [23].

The rise time of the insulated-gate bipolar transistor used in the circuit generally varies from 50 ns to several microseconds, which can lead to an extremely high rise rate for the output square wave [24]. When an impulse voltage with such a high rise rate is applied to the winding insulation of the motor, the voltage distribution across the windings becomes extremely uneven. It is believed that the inter-turn insulation on the head of the windings suffers the highest electric field intensity [25–29]. The relationship between the rising rate of the impulse voltage and the voltage distribution is illustrated in Fig. 3 [30–32].

2.2 Accumulative failure of winding insulation in inverter-fed motors and its mechanism

Motor winding insulation can be classified into type I and type II insulations. Motors with operating voltage levels lower than 700 V may have either type I or type II insulation. However, above this voltage level, type II winding insulation is generally used. The insulation material that is used between electromagnetic wires is generally organic material such as polyimide, polyester, or epoxy [33–36]. The presence of defects and sharp points in the windings and air gaps in the insulating dielectric, as shown in Fig. 4, are unavoidable in the manufacture of inverter-fed motors. When repetitive impulse voltages are applied to these windings, the electric fields of these defects, sharp points, and air gaps become strong, which means that the windings will age more easily or even fail prematurely.
Studies have indicated that the failure characteristics of the winding insulation under the application of bipolar impulses, positive impulses, and negative impulses are different. The lifetime of the winding insulation under the application of bipolar impulses is the shortest, whereas the lifetime under application of positive impulses is the longest. When the rise time of the impulses is longer than 0.07 μs, the lifetime of the winding insulation is observed to increase with increasing rise time. However, when the rise time of the impulses is shorter than 0.07 μs, the effects of the rise time are limited [42, 43].

Researchers have reported many results with regards to life models of motor winding insulation subjected to repetitive impulse voltages.

It was presented in [44] that the failure characteristics of bisphenol epoxy subjected to repetitive voltage surges and established a life model

\[
L = 2.3 \times 10^{10} V^{-3} R^{0.3} \tag{1}
\]

\[
L = 3.3 \times 10^{11} V^{-3} R^{0.69} \tag{2}
\]

where \(L\) is the number of surges required to initiate a tree; \(V\) is the surge voltage in kV; and \(R\) is the number of surges applied to the insulation per second. Equations (1) and (2), respectively, relate to positive and negative surges.

Guastavino et al. [40] pointed out that the lifetime of the dielectric is directly related to the frequency and amplitude of the impulse voltage and temperature. The study proposed a phenomenological life model based on a large number of test data

\[
D(V, f, \theta) = aE + bV^c + cV^d f \tag{3}
\]

where \(D\) is the lifetime of enamelled copper wires; \(V\) and \(f\) are, respectively, the amplitude and frequency of the applied voltage; and \(\theta\) is the environmental temperature. Here, \(a, b, c, a, b, c\) are coefficients with values that are summarised in Table 1.

In addition, it is believed that the voltage waveform has a significant effect on the dielectric's lifetime. The different lifetimes of twisted pairs, when subjected to repetitive impulse voltages with different waveforms, are plotted in Fig. 6 [45, 46]. The partial discharge (PD) characteristics of a dielectric under the application of impulse voltages with different waveforms are also different, resulting in differences in the failure characteristics. It was found, for example, that a long rise time of the applied voltage could lead to a low PD magnitude, and the PD frequency spectrum was also changed when the rise time varies [47]. The waveshape of the applied voltage was found to affect the PD extinction voltage (This effect depends on the type of dielectric and insulation structure [48]).

### 2.2.2 Accumulative failure mechanism:

It is believed that PDs are mainly responsible for the accumulative failure of winding insulation [2, 48–57]. It is generally believed that premature failure of winding insulation begins with the occurrence of PDs [12, 28, 52, 53]. PDs in small voids within the dielectric damage the insulation dielectric in several ways; e.g. through chemical reactions, the bombardment of high-energy ions/electrons, and ultraviolet radiation [58, 59]. Under the effects of bombardments and ultraviolet radiation in the PD process, covalent bonds at the void surface are broken and radicals form. These radicals react with gas and polymer form by-product liquid droplets, which deposit on the surface of voids (where the chemical composition depends on many factors, i.e. insulating material, gas, voltage, time, and discharge type) [59, 60]. This increases the conductivity and roughness of the void surface. Meanwhile, the local temperature increases and this can melt the dielectric and intensify damage [33]. Furthermore, PDs can result in the formation of crystal by-products with an acidic nature. The electric field on the tip of crystals is strengthened, which further intensifies PD activity. Finally, an electrical tree grows and there is breakdown [61, 62]. Physical models considering thermodynamic and electrokinetic...
processes have been established to describe the bond-breaking mechanism of an insulating dielectric subjected to repetitive impulses [63, 64].

Many scholars studied PD behaviour in solid dielectrics containing voids or gaps. Studies have introduced ‘Townsend-like’ discharge and ‘streamer-like’ discharge based on the Townsend and streamer breakdown mechanisms [65, 66]. The authors of the references believe the PD mechanism in voids has different features as the conditions change. One study [58] further pointed out that the discharge process of voids in dielectric can be classified into three stages (streamer-like, Townsend-like, and ‘pitting’ discharges). These stages are successive in time. The mechanisms and features of the above-mentioned discharges are different, and the damage caused by the discharges is, therefore, also different. Different by-products and morphologies were observed under the above three types of PDs. Generally, the transition between streamer-like discharges and Townsend-like discharges occurs when certain conditions are reached (see the literatures for more details [58, 65, 66]).

Note that the PD characteristics of dielectrics are closely related to the amplitude, frequency [11, 54], waveform [45, 46], polarity [16], and rise time [55, 56] of the impulse voltage. This behaviour is consistent with the statements given in Section 2.2.1. The factors listed above determine the accumulative failure characteristics and the lifetime of the dielectric by affecting the PD characteristics. However, one study found that even though PDs can reduce the lifetime of winding insulation, lifetime decreases when there are repetitive impulses in the absence of PDs [67]. Many researchers maintain that the surface/space charge plays an important role in the accumulative failure process of winding insulation. According to field-limited space charge current theory, there is a threshold field, denoted by $E_C$, below which the injected charges have low but finite mobility. Above $E_C$, the strongly non-linear dependence of this mobility on the electric field causes the space charge clouds to penetrate rapidly into the bulk insulation. Under the application of an AC voltage, large numbers of charges are injected and extracted, and this may then cause localised degradation [57, 68–72]. Note that the trapped charges may recombine, releasing residue energy and shifting the energy to other electrons through radiation. Radicals then form when high-energy electrons attract macromolecules [73]. It has been found that surface/space charges accumulating in a dielectric are causes of ageing because of the relevant local field enhancement and associated electromechanical energy storage [74]. The authors of the cited study established the Dissado–Mazzanti–Montanari (DMM) model (including the DC DMM model and AC DMM model) to explain space charge-induced long-term degradation of insulation (see the literatures for more details [57, 72, 75, 76]).

The effects of the surface charge on the failure of the dielectric are also closely related to the PD in the dielectric. The following analysis of this behaviour has been proposed [3, 77–79].

PDs first occur in air gaps in the insulation or between windings. Assuming that $E(t)$, with a maximum magnitude of $E_0$, is applied to the air gap. $E_P$ is the internal electric field that is generated by the surface charges in the air gap. The total electric field $E_0$ of the air gap can then be obtained as the difference between $E_0$ and $E_P$.

In Fig. 7a, discharge can occur when the total electric field $E_0$ of the air gap reaches the minimum breakdown electric field $E_{min}$. $E_i$ then reduces to the residual value $E_{res}$. More residual charges are generated during this discharge process, which enhance $E_P$. Therefore, $E_p$, which is equal to $(E_0-E_P)$, will be lower than the minimum breakdown electric field $E_{min}$ and the PD is thus extinguished, as shown in Fig. 7b.

When the polarity of the external electric field $E(t)$ is reversed, the polarities of the residual surface charges barely change because

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 1</th>
<th>Values of coefficients in the phenomenological life model of (3)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Coefficients</td>
<td>$A$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>values</td>
<td>3.816</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
of the very limited time. The total electric field $E_i$ of the air gap is then equal to $(E_0 + E_p)$, as shown in Fig. 7c.

Since the electric field $E_P$, which is governed by the surface charges in the air gap, is nearly equal to $(E_0 - E_{res})$, the total electric field in the air gap is given by $2E_0E_{res}$. Another discharge then starts in the air gap. The total electric field in the void drops again to $E_{res}$ and the surface charges in the air gap move to the opposite position under the effect of the electric field, as shown in Fig. 7d.

Yin [42, 43] and Yin et al. [80] believe that the premature failure of the winding insulation is due to PDS, surface charge, and dielectric heating. Among these three factors, dielectric heating plays an important role and is considered unavoidable under operational conditions. It has been noted that dielectric heating is one potential ageing mechanism that is active below the PD inception voltage (PDIV) in dielectric materials [81]. The operating temperature of a motor winding is typically higher than 80°C [82]. The machine's cooling ability is significantly reduced at low operating speeds because it decreases with a decreasing shaft fan speed. Additionally, voltage harmonics and a high $dv/dt$ cause increased dielectric losses in both the stator windings and the core insulation. This results in accelerated thermal deterioration, which shortens the remaining lifetime of the insulation [21].

In summary, studies on the accumulative failure of winding insulation used in inverter-fed motor flourished in the 1990s. Researchers around the world have made considerable advances in this area. To date, a consensus has already been reached on the failure characteristics and failure mechanism of winding insulation when subjected to repetitive impulse voltages, which has laid a firm foundation for studies of the accumulative failure of solid dielectrics.

3 Accumulative failure of oil–paper insulation

3.1 Background

Oil–paper insulation, acting as both the main insulation and inter-turn insulation, is widely used in power transformers. Operating data indicate that most recorded transformer faults are due to insulation failure [83–86]. According to operating data provided by the State Grid Corporation of China, 226 of their transformers (in voltage classes of 110 kV and over) were out of order over the period from 2000 to 2005, and most faults involved were related to insulation failure. The failure causes are summarised in Fig. 8a, whereas Fig. 8b plots corresponding data from the International Council on Large Electric Systems (CIGRE) [87, 88].

The statistical data indicate that the impulse voltage is not the main cause of transformer faults, with insulation failures directly due to impulse voltages accounting for only 8.2% of faults. However, impulse voltages, which include lightning impulse voltages and switching impulse voltages, occur frequently in power systems. Long-term monitoring results indicate that a typical power transformer may be subjected to tens of thousands of impulse voltages during its life cycle [89–91]. The oil–paper insulation that is used in power transformers may temporally maintain its electrical performance after the accumulation of repetitive impulse voltages. However, during the accumulation process, the cellulose fibres in the paper could be destroyed and new substances that adhere to the oil-impregnated paper (OIP) may also be generated, enhancing the unevenness of the insulating surface structure and increasing the risk of overheating failure [92]. More importantly, long-term accumulation of these repetitive impulse voltages may cause unrecoverable damage to the OIP and affect its electrical performance, which then threatens the safe operation of the power transformer. It is noted that because the frequency of the repetitive impulse voltages in inverter-fed motors is much higher than that in power transformers, the accumulation of repetitive impulse voltages is only considered to be an indirect factor that may lead to transformer faults.

In practise, the impulse voltages that are applied to the OIP in power transformers have the following features:

i. High amplitude: While the arresters that are installed in substations can, to a certain extent, restrict the amplitude and steepness of the impulse voltages, they cannot guarantee complete isolation of the transformer from the impulse voltages. When an impulse voltage is applied to the transformer windings, a complex electromagnetic transient process occurs in the windings, resulting in an uneven voltage distribution on the windings. In this case, $g$ on the head of the windings becomes extremely high (and much higher than the AC electric field acting on the winding insulation) [93–95].

ii. Complex waveform characteristics: Owing to factors including the input line attenuation, the wave processes in the windings, and arrester operation, the impulse voltage in the transformer winding is no longer the standard double-exponential wave recommended by the IEC standard (1/2.5/50 and 250/2500 μs [96]) but is in fact a non-standard wave. The typical waveform of a transformer-invading impulse voltage is shown in Fig. 9 [89–91]. For example, Okabe et al. presented four typical non-standard impulse waveforms that were recorded at a power transformer.
substation. They maintained that most impulse voltages recorded at this substation differed from the standard forms [96–114]. Even impulse voltages measured on transmission lines may also differ from the standard impulse voltage [113–117]. Studies have monitored the voltages and currents produced by lightning impulses on towers and transmission lines and found that the measurement results were directly related to the measurement position and method or even to the measurement device [118, 119]. In those studies, some of the recorded data were not the same as the standard data. These non-standard impulse voltages may cause more severe damage to the OIP and complicate the study of the accumulative failure of OIP insulation.

iii. Repeated application: An overvoltage monitoring system has been installed in a 110 kV substation located in China [89–91]. The voltage sensor was installed on the bushing tap of the main transformer. The monitoring work was performed for 11 years, and statistical data indicated that more than 50 lightning impulse voltages were recorded per year [89–91]. If we assume that the lifetime of a typical power transformer is 30 years, then the transformer will suffer more than 1500 lightning impulses during its lifetime. The frequency of the occurrence of switching impulse voltages is even higher. The reactive-load compensation equipment used in this substation is generally operated four to five times per day. The power transformer will thus suffer more than 40,000 switching impulses during its 30 year lifetime [120].

3.2 Accumulative failure of OIP and its mechanism

3.2.1 Finding the accumulative failure of OIP: In 1996, Okabe et al. found that an OIP sample broke down under the application of repetitive impulse voltages with amplitudes that were much lower than the OIP breakdown voltage. After the accumulation of more than 1000 impulses, both the breakdown voltage and the PDIV declined by <10%. They maintained that the reduction in the breakdown voltage could be considered as being the result of probabilistic breakdown; i.e. where the effect of the number of applications of the breakdown voltage is related to the breakdown probability, which is determined by the inherent weak points composed of the oil gaps or the pressboard barriers inside the transformer. The monitoring work was performed for 11 years, and statistical data indicated that more than 50 lightning impulse voltages were recorded per year [89–91]. If we assume that the lifetime of a typical power transformer is 30 years, then the transformer will suffer more than 1500 lightning impulses during its lifetime. The frequency of the occurrence of switching impulse voltages is even higher. The reactive-load compensation equipment used in this substation is generally operated four to five times per day. The power transformer will thus suffer more than 40,000 switching impulses during its 30 year lifetime [120].

Okabe et al. then obtained the accumulative failure characteristics of oil-paper insulation materials with various structures. The test voltage used was the standard lightning/switching impulse voltage. They determined the relationship between the amplitude of the impulse voltage (V) and the number of applications of the impulse before breakdown (N); i.e. the V–N characteristics. This relationship can be expressed using an exponential model [121]

\[ V = AN^{-1/n} \]  

where \( V \) is the minimum breakdown voltage, \( N \) is the number of impulses before breakdown at magnitude \( V \), \( A \) is the breakdown voltage of the dielectric, and \( n \) is a shape parameter.

Test results indicated that the \( n \)-values (i.e. the inclinations) of the V–N characteristics were, in most cases, distributed at around 70 for both the standard lightning/switching impulse voltage and at ~40 in turn-to-turn insulation models only [121].

In 2008, the CIGRE working group C4.302 simplified the Weibull distribution model and recommended the use of this simplified model to describe the V–N characteristics. The expressed form of the simplified Weibull distribution model is the same as that of the exponential model proposed in the literatures [7, 122]. In 2011, Balaji et al. [7] used this model to fit their test data and found that the values of \( A \) and \( n \) increased with a rising wavefront time. The effect of the wave-tail time on the value of \( A \) was limited, while the value of \( n \) decreased with decreasing wave-tail time [7]. Additionally, the authors noted that impulse withstand tests are widely used during the lifetimes of power transformers. Frequent application of impulse voltages on the transformer may also affect the electrical performance of the OIP, and this point is worthy of further attention. This view was supported by Okabe, who maintained that the accumulative effect mainly appeared during impulse tests. When deciding the insulation levels that are required for high-voltage equipment, detailed and precise data on the V–N characteristics of the insulating elements are essential to provide protection from lightning impulse voltages and switching impulse voltages [123].

In 2011, the development processes of streamers at the interface between oil and OIP were observed [124, 125]. The authors of the cited studies found that, under the application of repetitive lightning impulses, the length of the streamer grows with an increasing number of impulse applications. Flashover ultimately occurs. However, this phenomenon was not detected when the OIP was removed. This indicates that the accumulative effect appears not only during dielectric breakdown but also on flashover at the oil-paper interface [124, 125].

3.2.2 Effect of repetitive impulse voltages on the OIP: A translucent gelatinous substance was detected on the surface of an OIP that had been subjected to repetitive double-exponential impulses. This translucent gelatinous substance was easily dissolved in acetone. In addition, the colour of the OIP surface that had been covered by the electrode had changed and differed from that of the surface areas away from the electrode, as shown in Fig. 10. This indicates that the accumulation of repetitive impulse voltages can damage the surface of OIP [92]. Using an atomic force microscope, the surface micro-morphology of fresh OIP and that of OIP subjected to 200, 400, 600, and 800 standard lightning impulses have been observed [92]. That study found that the accumulation of repetitive lightning impulses can dramatically increase surface roughness, which is believed to be caused by PDs in the oil film between the electrode and the OIP sample, as shown in Fig. 11.

The dielectric properties of OIP vary when repetitive impulse voltages are applied to the OIP sample. It was found that the real and imaginary parts of relative permittivity, the conductivity, and the dielectric loss tangent \( \tan \delta \) of the OIP increase with the number of impulse applications. This phenomenon was more obvious at low frequency [126, 127]. One study analysed the relationship between dielectric properties and microcosmic damaging process and proposed that high-energy electrons

---

**Fig. 9** Measured overvoltage waveform

**Fig. 10** Morphology of cellulose paper specimens extracted using acetone (a) Virgin OIP, (b)–(e) OIP under applications of 100, 200, 300, and 400 lightning impulses, respectively
becomes extremely high. PDs thus occur repeatedly in the oil.

3.2.3 Accumulative failure mechanism of OIP:

As noted in the previous section, repetitive application of impulse voltages can cause accumulative damage to the OIP and thus lead to a reduction in the electrical performance; i.e. when an impulse voltage is applied to an OIP sample, the electric field intensity in the oil pores becomes extremely high. PDs thus occur repeatedly in the oil pores. As a result of collisions between charged particles and electrons, some of the cellulose fibres break and form new substances. During this process, the cellulose paper suffers unrecoverable damage and this reduces the OIP breakdown voltage [92, 128].

It is believed, however, that accumulative damage is not the sole reason for the premature failure of OIP. Space charges also play an important role in this failure process. In general, there are two aspects to the effects of space charges on dielectric performance. On the one hand, the existence, migration, and dissipation of space charges affect the electric field distribution in the dielectric directly. This can either weaken or strengthen the local electric field in the dielectric and thus affects the breakdown voltage of the dielectric [129–131]. On the other hand, the trapping, detrapping, and recombination of space charges may cause emission of photons or release local mechanical energy, which can break the chemical bonds in the dielectric and thus affect the insulation characteristics of the dielectric [74, 132].

Researchers have argued that the study of the space charge characteristics in OIP that has been subjected to repetitive impulse voltages lacks an engineering application background because space charges may dissipate before application of the next impulse voltage. The authors of this review believe that in areas where thunderstorms commonly occur, there are frequent lightning impulse voltages in power systems. The effects of space charge accumulation are, therefore, worthy of study to some extent. During a thunderstorm process, several return strokes can appear within a single lightning strike. The interval time between these return strokes varies from tens to hundreds of milliseconds [133]. Even the interval time between two independent lightning strikes generally varies from tens of seconds to several minutes. In this case, the space charges that accumulate in the OIP do not have sufficient time to dissipate, which may then affect the accumulative failure characteristics of the OIP [134].

The pulsed electro-acoustic method was adopted to determine the space charge distributions in OIP samples subjected to repetitive lightning impulses with different numbers of applications, different amplitudes, and different interval times, with the results shown in Fig. 12. Most space charges detected in the OIP samples had the same polarity. As the number of applications and the amplitude of the impulse voltage increased, the space charge density in the OIP gradually increased, showing a saturation trend. Increases in the interval time between the applied impulses contribute to the dissipation of the space charge and thus reduce the space charge density [134].

The effects of space charge on the accumulative failure of OIP insulation are summarised as follows. Under the effect of repetitive impulse voltages, numerous positive charges are injected into the OIP and tend to accumulate in the dielectric near the anode. Meanwhile, electrons are injected from the cathode, and some pass through the dielectric and are then neutralised in the anode. As the accumulation of lightning impulses continues, some of the positive charges near the anode escape their traps and migrate toward the cathode under the effect of the applied impulses. Finally, the numerous positive charges become dominant in the bulk. These charges enhance the electric field intensity near the cathode and thereby contribute to the failure of the OIP [133, 134].

Dielectric accumulative damage and space charge accumulation are considered to be the two main reasons for premature failure of the OIP. The following experiment was designed to determine which of these factors plays the main role in accumulative failure.

Since the space charges dissipate during the interval between two consecutive impulses, a finite interval time is required for the space charge to play a role in the accumulative failure of the OIP. The amplitude of the applied impulse voltage and the interval time were, respectively, set at 20 kV and 60 s. It was found that the OIP sample broke down after an average of 124 impulse applications. Using an unchanged test setup, repetitive impulse voltages were then applied to the OIP sample. After each batch of 30 shots, the test was stopped for 2 h. During this time, an automatic grounding rod was connected to the high-voltage terminal to release the space charge in the OIP sample. It is interesting to note that, in this case, an average value of 1001 impulses had to be applied to breakdown the OIP sample, which is a higher number than in the test without the 2 h waiting period. The test indicates that the space charge plays the main role in the accumulative breakdown process. To some extent, however, this test also verifies the effects of the electrical degradation caused by repetitive lightning impulses, because the breakdown of the OIP sample still occurred without the effects of the space charge [135].
3.2.4 Effects of waveform parameters on the V–N characteristics: A recorded non-standard impulse waveform was converted into a double-exponential impulse waveform using the equivalent energy. The statistical wavefront and wave-tail times of the converted non-standard impulse are 20/198 μs [89, 90]. Under standard lightning impulse (1.2/50 μs), standard switching impulse (250/2500 μs), and converted non-standard impulse (20/198 μs) conditions, the 50% breakdown voltages of OIP are, respectively, 58.7, 56.7, and 60.2 kV. In the case that the amplitudes of all test impulse voltages are the same, the numbers of impulse applications required before breakdown increased in the order of the standard lightning impulse <converted non-standard impulse<standard switching impulse [89, 135].

The effects of the waveform parameters of the double-exponential impulse voltage on the V–N characteristics are understood clearly. As the wavefront time increases, the breakdown voltage of the OIP and its ability to resist repetitive impulse voltages both increase accordingly, while the effect of the wave-tail time on the breakdown voltage is very limited. The ability of the OIP to resist repetitive impulse voltages weakens with increasing wave-tail time [89, 135].

The mechanism by which the waveform parameters affect the breakdown voltage and the V–N characteristics can be summarised as follows. On the one hand, the waveform parameters affect the movement of the positive charges within the micro oil pores contained in the OIP, which can affect the electric field distributions in these micro oil pores to a remarkable extent. On the other hand, the waveform parameters affect the trapping and detrapping balance between the charged particles in the OIP. All the above phenomena are closely related to both the breakdown voltage and the V–N characteristics [136].

In contrast, the failure characteristics of the OIP under the application of damped alternating oscillation impulses are much more complex [137–139]. When the oscillation frequency is increased from 200 Hz to 30 kHz, the OIP breakdown voltage initially decreases and then increases. The turning point in the breakdown voltage corresponds to an oscillation frequency of 1 kHz (as shown in Fig. 13). When the half-peak time is varied from 35 to 160 μs, the OIP breakdown voltage decreases with increasing half-peak time [140].

One study [140] defined the peak times $t_{\text{max}}$ and $t_{\text{con}}$, which are the total sum of the time periods for which the voltage was at $V_0$ (a threshold level) or higher. On the basis of further tests that study determined the relationship between the two variables above and estimated the breakdown voltage under the application of damped alternating oscillation impulses as

$$U_{50} = -\left(U_0 + A_1 t_{\text{con}} + A_2 t_{\text{max}}\right)$$

where $U_0$, $A_1$, and $A_2$ are fitting parameters.

For damped alternating oscillation impulses with various waveform parameters, the $V$–$N$ characteristics curve for the OIP moves upwards as the oscillation frequency increases. When the half-peak time increases, the $V$–$N$ characteristics curve of OIP moves upwards and tends to flatten at an earlier stage [140].

3.2.5 Difference between failure characteristics under the application of double-exponential impulses and damped alternating oscillation impulses: The OIP failure characteristics under application of double-exponential impulses differ from the characteristics under application of damped alternating oscillation impulses. Sun et al. [89] and Sima et al. [90] showed the equivalence of these two impulses, i.e. they found that the breakdown voltage of OIP under a specific damped alternating oscillation impulse is the same as that under the equivalent double-exponential impulse. However, a follow-up study indicated that even under the application of a damped alternating oscillation impulse and its equivalent double-exponential impulse, the $V$–$N$ characteristics obtained for those two equivalent impulses still differ. When the amplitudes of the applied impulses are the same, the ability of OIP to resist repetitive damped alternating oscillation impulses is stronger than the ability of OIP to resist repetitive equivalent double-exponential impulses. More importantly, a paste-like substance (as shown in Fig. 14) was detected on the surface of OIP that had been subjected to repetitive damped alternating oscillation impulses. This paste-like substance differs from the translucent gelatinous substance found during the double-exponential impulse accumulation test. This indicates that the accumulative damage mechanisms of the two impulses described above may be different. In addition, the space charge distribution in OIP subjected to damped alternating oscillation impulses is different from that in OIP subjected to double-exponential impulses. Therefore, the determination of the accumulative failure mechanisms of these two types of impulses is an interesting prospective research direction.

4 Future challenges

To date, the premature failure characteristics and mechanisms of winding insulation materials subjected to repetitive impulse voltages have been studied widely. Numerous results have been reported within this area of research, particularly for the accumulative failure of motor winding insulation. However, the following problems have still to be addressed:
i. Further study of the microcosmic failure mechanism of winding insulation: PDs and space/surface charges have a close relation and both affect the accumulative failure process of motor winding insulation. PDs are also considered a source of charge injection [3, 77–79]. It is important to experimentally investigate the charge behaviours and simultaneously observe PD activity in a microcosmic manner. This would be helpful in revealing the interaction mechanism of space/surface charge and PD [61]. Moreover, it is believed that the bombardment of high-energy electrons in the PD process breaks bonds and forms by-products [59, 60, 63, 64, 73, 141]. However, the microcosmic process of bonds breaking and degradation has not been fully revealed. Molecular dynamics simulation may further reveal the failure mechanism, considering the limitations of currently available measurement techniques.

ii. Differences in terms of failure characteristics and failure mechanisms of OIP when subjected to double-exponential impulses and damped alternating oscillation impulses: Preliminary studies have indicated that the failure characteristics of OIP samples that have been subjected to standard/non-standard impulses are different. Determination of the failure mechanism of OIP, when subjected to damped alternating oscillation impulses and finding the difference with respect to the failure mechanism that occurs under the application of double-exponential impulses, will help clarify the accumulative failure phenomenon in depth. Moreover, the waveshape of the applied voltage is believed to affect PD activities in the dielectric [47]. Since PD is considered an important factor that results in the accumulative failure of OIP, it is important to study the relationship among the waveshape, PDs, and failure mechanism of OIP.

iii. A waveform equivalent method for both double-exponential impulses and damped alternating oscillation impulses: Considering that, during operation, OIP insulation is subjected to damped alternating oscillation impulses rather than the double-exponential impulses recommended by the relevant IEC standard, the study of the failure characteristics of OIP insulation under damped alternating oscillation impulse conditions is important. However, the generation of damped alternating oscillation impulses in engineering practise is unrealistic. Therefore, the establishment of a waveform equivalent method between the double-exponential impulses and the damped alternating oscillation impulses will be important.

iv. Improvement in the ability of winding insulation to resist repetitive impulse voltages: Non-thermal plasma treatments and nanomodification methods are widely used to improve the electrical performance of motor insulation [142–152]. For OIP, researchers have mainly adopted nanomodification methods to improve the electrical performance. An attempt has been made to improve the ability of OIP to resist repetitive impulse voltages by suspending nanoparticles in the paper pulp and impregnating the paper using nanomodified oil. Both these methods have produced good results [84, 153–160]. However, more attention needs to be given to the comprehensive improvement of the insulating dielectric rather than the electrical performance; e.g. an increase in the space charge dissipation rate, enhancement of mechanical and thermal properties, and improvement of nanoparticle stability. Moreover, new methods may be important in improving the ability of the winding insulation to resist repetitive impulse voltages.

5 Conclusions
The above literature review reveals that motor winding insulation breaks down prematurely under the application of repetitive PWM-like impulses. The amplitude, frequency, polarity, and wavefront rise time of each of the applied impulses affect the lifetime of the winding insulation. PDs and the presence of space charges are considered to be the main reasons for the accumulative failure of motor winding insulation, with PDs playing the dominant role. With regards to the accumulative failure of OIP insulation in power transformers, newly formed substances on the OIP surface were found during the accumulation process. It is believed that the waveform parameters affect the $V$–$N$ characteristics dramatically. The failure of OIP insulation is due to both accumulative damage and space charge accumulation. Specifically, the failure characteristics and failure mechanism of OIP subjected to double-exponential impulses differ from those of OIP subjected to damped alternating oscillation impulses. We believe that future challenges in this field of research are determination of the failure mechanism of OIP that has been subjected to damped alternating oscillation impulses, the proposal of a waveform equivalent method for double-exponential impulses and damped alternating oscillation impulses, and improvement of the ability of winding insulation to resist repetitive impulse voltages.

6 Acknowledgments
This work was supported by the National Natural Science Foundation of China (51707023), the National Basic Research Program (973 Program) (2015CB251003), the National Key R&D Program of China (2017YFB0902702), the China’s Postdoctoral Science Fund (2017M62962), and the Chongqing Postdoctoral Science Special Foundation (Xm2017197).

7 References
Masdi, H., Mariun, N., Mohamed, A.

Okabe, S., Koto, M., Kato, K.


10 High Volt., 2019, Vol. 4, Iss. 1, pp. 1-11

This is an open access article published by the IET and CEPR under the Creative Commons Attribution -NonCommercial License (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/3.0/)
[135] Sun, P.: ‘Study on accumulative effect of repeated lightning impulse on oil-paper insulation and its influence factors’ (Chongqing University, Chongqing, 2016), in Chinese


